Elżbieta Wiącek

Jagiellonian University in Kraków

"THE ORIENT" IN GLOBAL CULTURAL FLOW: THE CASE OF THE TURKISH RIVIERA

Abstract: Tourism has become an important sector in Turkey as a growing source of foreign exchange reserves and employment over the last two decades. An increasing number of foreign tourists makes the Turkish Riviera an area of intense global interaction. According to Arjun Appadurai, the new global cultural economy has to be seen as an overlapping, disjunctive order that can no longer be understood in terms of the existing center-periphery models. This article will explore such disjunctures and deal with the complex "-scapes" of the Turkish Riviera. It aims to look at the relationships among the five dimensions of the global cultural flow: *ethnoscapes*, *mediascapes*, *technoscapes*, *financescapes*, and *ideoscapes*. One goal of this review is to examine if the concept of "the Orient" coined by Edward Said still exists within the discourse and the visual imagery of tourism.

Keywords: the Turkish Riviera, tourism, Orient, disjuncture, "-scapes".

"ORIENTALISM" - GAME OVER?

Edward Said begins his best-known book *Orientalism* with the assumption that "the Orient is not an inert fact of nature". Moreover, he claims that it is the space which is not merely "there". Drawing on Giambattista Vico's notion of history, Said argues that man makes not only his own history, but also his own geography: "such locales, regions, geographical sectors as 'Orient' and 'Occident' are man-made. Therefore, as much as the West itself, the Orient is an idea that has a history and a tradition of thought, imagery, and vocabulary that have given it reality and presence". He analyses the cultural misrepresentation of "the Orient" in general, and of the Middle East in particular.

¹ E. Said, *Orientalism*, Vintage Books, New York 1979, p. 4.

² *Ibidem*, p. 5.

The central idea of "Orientalism" is that the Western knowledge about the East is not generated from facts or reality, but from preconceived archetypes that envision all "Eastern" societies as fundamentally similar to one another, and fundamentally dissimilar to "Western" societies. This discourse establishes "the East" as antithetical to "the West". Said argues that Orient and Occident worked as oppositional terms, so that "the Orient" was constructed as an inversion of the Western culture. It is an image of what is inferior and alien ("Other") to the West. Orientalism is a way of coming to terms with the Orient that is based on its special place in Western European experience. Said contends that "The Orient was almost an European invention, and had been since antiquity a place for romance, exotic beings, haunting memories and landscapes, remarkable experiences"3. Orientalism is also a Western style of dominating, restructuring, and having authority over the Orient⁴. For this reason, "the Orient" signifies a system of representations framed by political forces. Drawing on Michel Foucault's notion of "discourse"⁵, Said stresses that without examining Orientalism as a discourse one cannot possibly understand the systematic discipline by which European culture was able to manage – and even produce – the Orient politically, sociologically, ideologically and imaginatively⁶. In brief, Orientalism should not be thought of as a structure of lies or myths. It is, rather, a system of knowledge about the Orient⁷.

Said's discussion of academic Orientalism is almost entirely limited to late 19th and early 20th century scholarship. Most academic Area Studies departments had already abandoned the imperialist or colonialist paradigm of scholarship. In Said's opinion, the Orient is "disappearing, in a sense it had happened, its time was over". However, I would argue that "the Orient" still exists within the discourse and the visual imagery of tourism.

³ *Ibidem*, p. 1.

Ibidem, p. 3.

Described by Foucalt in *The Archeology of Knowledge* and *Discipline and Punish*. Following the ideas of Michel Foucault, Said emphasized the relationship between power and knowledge in scholarly and popular thinking, in particular regarding European views of the Islamic Arab world

⁶ E. Said, *op. cit.*, p. 3.

Ibidem, p. 6.

⁸ Ibidem.

"THE ORIENT" IS FEMALE

The depiction of this singular "Orient" which can be studied as a cohesive whole has deeply influenced the discourse of tourism. The website www.thomascook.pl, offering different tourist destinations, shows a fragment of a woman's face, her beautiful eyes visible above a veil decorated with jewels. In the middle of the picture, above some marble tiles, is the advertising slogan: "Tempting Orient – at the lowest price". The content of the image evokes the feeling of luxury and mystery, while the slogan suggests that these remarkable experiences are within our easy reach.



http://www.thomascook.pl/Last-minute.html

It is not surprising that the Orient has a woman's face. Within the discourse of Orientalism, even the Oriental man is depicted as feminine (yet strangely dangerous because he poses a threat to the Western women). The Oriental woman is not only strikingly exotic, but also seems eager to be dominated. The picture from the website follows the model of an Oriental woman inspired – according to Said – by Flaubert's encounter with an Egyptian courtesan. She "never spoke of herself, she never represented her emotions, presence or history. **He** spoke for her and represented her. He was foreign, comparatively wealthy and male". Said argues that Flaubert's relation with his exotic lover was not an isolated instance. It stands for the strong pattern of relations between East and West and the discourse about the Orient that it enabled 10. This discourse is laced with notions of power and superiority. The

⁹ E. Said, *op. cit.*, p. 6.

¹⁰ *Ibidem*, p. 6.

feminine Orient awaits the dominance of the West; it exists for its Western counterpart. For Said these cultural prejudices are derived from a long tradition of the romanticized images of Asia and of the Middle East.

TURKEY - "SCENT OF THE ORIENT AT THE EDGE OF CONTINENTS"

The Oriental is a stereotype that crosses countless cultural and national boundaries¹¹. Said focuses on the Eurocentric prejudice against Arabo-Islamic peoples and their culture, but what is considered "the Orient" in tourist discourse is a vast area that also includes the non-Arab countries of the Middle East. One of them is Turkey¹², officially the Republic of Turkey. The way the tourist agencies portray Turkey reflects the geopolitical placement of this transcontinental country, located mostly on the Anatolian Peninsula in Western Asia and on East Thrace in Southeastern Europe. The leading Polish website advertising Turkey as a good place for holidays states that "Turkey is a mixture of oriental culture, interesting monuments, fascinating places, golden beaches and warm blue sea"¹³. Another example comes from the catalogue of Scan Holiday: "Turkey. Scent of the Orient at the edge of continents". In both advertisements Turkey is identified as a borderland between East and West.

Tourism in Turkey has experienced rapid growth in the last twenty years, and constitutes an important part of its economy. In 2011, Turkey welcomed 33.3 million foreign visitors, which made the country the sixth most-popular tourist destination in the world and the fourth one in Europe¹⁴. Tourism in Turkey is focused largely in a variety of historical sites (with Istanbul as the most important one), and in the seaside resorts along its Aegean and Mediterranean Sea coasts. The Turkish Riviera¹⁵ is a term used to define an area of southwest Turkey encompassing the provinces of Antalya and Muğla,

¹¹ According to Orientalist scholars Orient includes most of Asia as well as the Middle East.

The English name *Turkey* first appeared in the late 14th century, and is derived from Medieval Latin *Turchia*. Harper, Douglas (2001). "Turkey" Online Etymology Dictionary. Retrieved 16 June 2013.

¹³ http://www.turcja.com.pl, 15.10.2013.

In 2011 tourists contributed \$23 billion to Turkey's revenues. Foreign tourist arrivals increased substantially in Turkey between 2002 and 2005, from 12.8 million to 21.2 million, which made Turkey a top-10 destination in the world for foreign visitors. Tourism Statistics from the official website of Ministry of Culture and Tourism; http://www.kultur.gov.tr/EN,36568/number-of-arriving-departing-visitors-foreigners-and-ci-.html, 15.10.2013.

The Turkish Riviera is also known popularly as the Turquoise Coast.

and to a lesser extent Aydın, southern İzmir and western Mersin. The area includes the Aegean Region and the Mediterranean Region. The combination of a favorable climate, warm sea, more than a thousand kilometers of shoreline, and archeological points of interest¹⁶ makes this area a popular national and international tourist destination.

NEW GLOBAL CULTURAL ECONOMY

The increasing number of foreign tourist makes the Turkish Riviera an area of global interaction. According to Appadurai (1996), the new global cultural economy has to be seen as a complex, overlapping, disjunctive order that can no longer be understood in terms of the existing center-periphery models¹⁷. Nor it is susceptible to the simple models of push and pull (in terms of the migration theory) or consumers and producers. In his opinion, even the most flexible theories deriving from the Marxist tradition have failed to come to terms with what Scott Lash and John Urry have called disorganized capitalism¹⁸. The complexity of current global economy has to do with certain fundamental disjunctures between economy, culture, and politics.

Appadurai claims that the world has now become a single system with a range of complex subsystems. He is opposed to the account of globalization as cultural imperialism, which fuels much of the dependency theory and world-systems analysis. Appadurai proposes that an elementary framework for exploring such disjunctures is to look at the relationships among the five dimensions of global cultural flow that can be termed

- ethnoscapes,
- mediascapes,
- technoscapes,
- financescapes,
- ideoscapes¹⁹.

_

Among the archeological points of interest are two of the Seven Wonders of the Ancient World: The ruins of the Mausoleum of Maussollos in Halicarnassus; and the Temple of Artemis in Ephesus.

A. Appadurai, *Modernity At Large: Cultural Dimensions of Globalization*, Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press 1996, pp. 27-29.

¹⁸ S. Lash, J. Urry *The End of Organized Capitalism*, Cambridge: Polity Books, 1987.

¹⁹ A. Appadurai, *op. cit.*, pp. 32-33.

The suffix –scape allows him to point to the fluid, irregular shapes of these landscapes, the shapes that characterize international capital as deeply as they do international clothing styles. These terms also indicate that these are not objectively given relations that look the same from every angle of vision. Each of these "scapes" is constructed by particular perspectives, created by social actors²⁰. These landscapes are thus the building blocks of the "imagined worlds". Appadurai's concept is similar to Benedict Anderson's idea of the nation as an imagined community. The anthropologist believes that we now live in such globally imagined worlds and not simply in locally imagined communities.

THE ETHNOSCAPE OF THE SEA RESORTS

By *ethnoscape*, Appadurai means the people constituting the shifting landscape we live in: the tourists, immigrants, refugees, exiles, guest workers, and other moving groups and individuals. Ethnoscapes arise then from multi-directional movements. This is not to say that there are no relatively stable communities and networks of kinship, work, or leisure, as well as of birth, residence, and other filial forms. But it is to say that the warp of these stabilities is everywhere shot through with the woof of human motion, as more persons and groups deal with the realities of having to move or the fantasies of wanting to move²¹.

Analysing the ethnoscape of the Turkish Riviera one should consider both the local communities (including seasonal workers) and the multiethnic flow of tourists. Article 66 of the Turkish Constitution defines a "Turk" as "anyone who is bound to the Turkish state through the bond of citizenship"; therefore, the legal use of the term "Turkish" as a citizen of Turkey is different from the ethnic definition. However, the majority of the Turkish population are of Turkish ethnicity. They are estimated at 70-75 per cent²². The three minority groups officially recognized in the Treaty of Lausanne are Armenians, Greeks, and Jews. Minorities other than the three officially recognized ones do not have specific minority rights, while the term "minority" itself remains

These constructs are inflected by the historical, linguistic and political situatedness of different sort of actors: nation states, multinationals, diasporic communities, as well as subnational groupings and movements. A. Appadurai, *op. cit.*, p. 33.

²¹ *Ibidem*, pp. 33-34.

²² CIA World Factbook https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/tu. html: 20.10.2013.

a sensitive issue in Turkey²³. The largest non-Turkish ethnic group are the Kurds, variously estimated at around 19 per cent. Other ethnic groups include among others: Albanians, Crimean Tatars (7 per cent), Arabs (2 per cent)²⁴. With the beginning of the tourist season a lot of people (mostly men) from different parts of Turkey come to seaside resorts to work in hotels and in Turkish baths (hammam) on the Riviera. Every year from May to October seasonal workers become a big part of local communities. The seasonal migrations within the country are one of the factors which influence the ethnoscape of the Turkish Riviera. Another factor is the flow of both Turkish and foreign tourists which mainly come from Germany, Russia, United Kingdom, the Netherlands, France, Italy, the Arab world, Caucasia, and Japan. The tourists from North America and Scandinavia are also not uncommon. There seems to be a trend for the British tourists to go on holiday to the Aegean resorts such as Bodrum or Marmaris, while the Russian and Arab tourists almost exclusively visit the resorts on the Mediterranean coast of southern Turkey (e.g. Antalya).



Bitez 2009; photo E. Wiącek

The Government of Turkey is frequently being criticized for its treatment of minorities. www.turkstat.gove.tr: 20.10.2013.

The complexity of the ethnoscape is probably most visible on the beaches. Roland Barthes noted in his *Mythologies* that one can find semiotic messages even on the beach²⁵. One of such messages are the clothes. Next to the women from Europe sunbathing in bikinis or even topless are the traditionally dressed Turkish women or tourists from the Arabic countries bathing in special costumes covering the whole body. Another space of interactions of different ethnic groups are the discos and bars²⁶.

Agata Bromberek, the Polish resident working with the tourists in Alanya has coined the term "a Turkish tourist worker". In her opinion the Turkish men working on the Riviera have much more in common with the Italians, Spaniards, or Egyptians working in the sea resorts in their countries than with typical Turks doing other jobs. Bromberek claims that even the deep knowledge of Alanya or similar towns does not give us any valuable knowledge of Turkey. It gives us only the knowledge about the life in a sea resort²⁷.

There are towns on the Turkish Riviera where the people from the West have become a fixed element of the ethnoscape. The evidences of their presence can be found e.g. in Alaçatı – an Aegean town on the western coast of the Izmir Province, which has been famous for its architecture, vineyards and windmills for over 150 years, and has recently made its name in the world of windsurfing and kitesurfing. With two British airlines offering direct flights to nearby Izmir, the resort is now easily accessible to British travellers who want an authentic Turkish experience. The signs of London tube stations vie with the names of Turkish streets and create an impression of multiethnicity. The complex ethnoscape of Alaçatı also includes the houses abandoned by the Greeks. The place was a Greek settlement area which became an Ottoman town in the 15th century. However, at the end of the 19th century, the Moslem population was a minority in the town²⁸. The Greek population of Alaçatı was forced to leave in 1914, but most of it returned in 1919 during the Greek administration of Smyrna (1919-1922) when the Hellenic Army occupied the region of Izmir. The majority fled with the retreating Greek Army following Greece's defeat in the Greco-Turkish War, whilst others fled from the shores

²⁵ Barthes R., *Mit i znak*, Warszawa 1970, p. 29.

http://offtrackplanet.com/magazine/articles/getting-drunk-with-locals-10-best-local-bars-in-turkey.

A. Bromberek, A. Wielgołaska, *Turcja. Półprzewodnik obyczajowy*, Warszawa, p. 231.
 Cf. A. Spyros Sofos, U. Özkırımlı, *Tormented by History: Nationalism in Greece and Turkey*, C Hurst & Co Publishers. 2008, pp. 116–117.

of Smyrna²⁹. The emigration of the Greek population was transformed into a population exchange backed by international legal guarantees³⁰. The Treaty of Lausanne in 1923 sanctioned the compulsory exchange of populations: the Muslims who lived in Crete, Thrace, Macedonia and Dodecanese settled in Alaçatı in the houses abandoned by the Greeks³¹. Most of these houses still remain in Alaçatı.





Alaçatı 2011; photo E. Wiacek

THE TECHNOSCAPES AND FINANSCAPES OF THE RIVIERA

By *technoscape*, Appadurai means the ever-fluid global configuration of technology and the fact that technology, both high and low, both mechanical and informational, now crosses at fast pace the various previously impervious boundaries³². Technoscapes arise from rapid technological diffusion and flow across national boundaries. Appadurai believes these flows are increasingly complex and multi-directional, in contrast to older models of technological dependency. The landscape of the Turkish Riviera brings many examples of

²⁹ Z.Y. Hershlag, *Introduction to the Modern Economic History of the Middle East*, Brill Academic Pub 1997, p. 177.

Y. Kats, Partner to partition: the Jewish Agency's partition plan in the mandate era, Routledge 1998, p. 88.

³¹ http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Ala%C3%A7at%C4%B1; 11.11.2013.

³² A. Appadurai, op. cit., p. 34.

multinational enterprise in the field of technology. The Antique Theatre in Bodrum features the names of two telecommunications companies carved in stone. In 2000 Turkcell (the leading Turkish mobile phone operator) and Ericsson³³ started the project of restoration of the site of the theatre, built during Greek and Roman times, under the supervision of Bodrum's Museum for Underwater Archaeology.



Antique Theatre in Bodrum http://www.lavanta.com/francais/album.asp?id=7

The landscape of the Turkish Riviera shows that some old technologies are replaced by new ones. The characteristic, white-domed water cisterns made of stone, called *gümbet*³⁴, are falling into ruin since the introduction of electric and gasoline pumps. The ruins of the old hilltop windmills are another sign of changing technology. This does not mean, however, that the technological traditions of the area are completely forgotten. The past is still remembered in souvenirs and names. The windmills in Bodrum are no longer

Ericsson is a Swedish multinational technology company that provides and operates tele-communications networks, television and video systems, and related services. In 2012 it was the world's largest provider of wireless network equipment, with a market share of 38%. The company has offices and operations in more than 180 countries. http://www.reuters.com/article/2012/06/11/markets-nordics-factors-idUSL5E8HB0K320120611; 11.11.2013.

³⁴ In Turkish *gümbet* means "dome".

in use, but they are still the most popular motif of the souvenirs and postcards sold in the town and in the nearby villages which have become sea resorts. The water cisterns gave their name to the new resort called *Gümbet* located on the South-west coast of Turkey. This resort, very popular with the British tourists, is geared towards younger holidaymakers, who spend time on the beaches by day and in bars and clubs by night.





Mills and souvenirs in Bodrum, 2008; photo E. Wiącek

The fluid global configuration of technology is especially visible in the Turkish marinas. They are the ports of call for international and local yachtsmen equipped with modern services³⁵. Although the history of modern infrastructure geared to recreational boating in Turkey is only slightly more than thirty years long, one may predict the country's increasing popularity among nautical tourists, because of its spectacular coastline³⁶. Marinas are now found in many resorts on the Aegean Sea or the Mediterranean Sea (İzmir is the largest port city on the Riviera)³⁷. In recent years, they offer modern infrastructure and necessary facilities, offering a whole range of services. Some of the marinas³⁸ are operated by locally based enterprises, but international investments are dominating. Port Göcek is managed by the

There are close to three dozen marinas currently operational in Turkey and the Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus.

http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Marinas in Turkey; 11.11.2013.

³⁶ Ihidem

Alaçatı Marina and İzmir's Levent Marina.

British company Camper and Nicholson³⁹, in a joint-venture with the owner, Turkey's Turkon Holding. The marina is part of an integrated leisure compound, at the tip of a natural park and complete with a Swissotel and the beach gravel brought over from Canada⁴⁰. In 2006, Camper and Nicholson also won the bid, together with IC Holding, for the completion and the operation of the Çeşme harbour marina⁴¹.

The creation of the specific technoscapes is frequently driven not by any obvious economic or political rationality, but by the increasingly complex relationships between the money flows and the availability of both unskilled and highly skilled labor. The phenomenon of seasonal workers lets us notice that ethnoscapes and technoscapes are interrelated and fluid. The development of the marinas shows that the technoscapes are also tightly interconnected with finanscapes. Finanscapes arise from rapid financial flows and the emerging global political economy. Appadurai believes that these flows are increasingly complex and multi-directional, in contrast to older models of technological dependency. The distribution of global capital is now a more mysterious and difficult landscape to follow than ever before. But the critical point is that the global relationships among the ethnoscapes, technoscapes and finanscapes is deeply disjunctive and profoundly unpredictable because each of these landscapes is subject to its own constrains⁴². A good example of those relationships is the billboard from Gümbet (the Aegean region) advertising a local restaurant. Its visual elements allude to the antique past of the region. while the slogan "European cuisine, Irish management" - to its present complex ethnoscape. The name of the restaurant – Annalivia – refers to the bronze sculpture located in Croppies Memorial Park in Dublin, Ireland⁴³. The sculpture represents Anna Livia, a personification of the River Liffev which runs through the city. Anna Livia Plurabelle is also the name of a character in James Joyce's Finnegans Wake⁴⁴. The ethnoscape of the place presented on the billboard is accompanied by the finanscape represented by the images of credit cards.

widely recognised to be the world's oldest and most prestigious yachting business name. http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Marinas in Turkey; 11.11.2013.

http://www.cnmarinas.com/problem.htm?error_guid=000035-550df6fb-52813abd-9d66-78 5a601c, http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Marinas_in_Turkey; 11.11.2013.

⁴² Appadurai, *op. cit.*, p. 35.

⁴³ It was formerly located on O'Connell Street. See: *New home for Dublin "Flozzy"*. Story from BBC NEWS: http://news.bbc.co.uk/go/pr/fr/-/2/hi/uk_news/northern_ireland/ 464174 2.stm: 11.11.2013.

⁴⁴ The river is represented as a young woman sitting on a slope with water flowing past her from Finnegans wake.



Gümbet, 2009; photo E. Wiącek

Gastronomy and catering is the field where technoscapes, finanscapes and ethnoscapes overlap. One can have a Turkish coffee or a latte from Starbuck. One can have dinner at one of the fish restaurants which abound in the seaside towns, a typical Turkish fast food *döner*, or a Happy Meal at a Mc Donalds, a common lunch place in the bigger towns and cities. Alongside the first class Turkish restaurants, the tourists can choose from a variety of international cuisines, catering for those with Mexican, Chinese, American or German tastes.





Bodrum, 2008; photo E. Wiacek

MEDIASCAPES: THE WOODEN HORSE AT TROY

Further reflecting these disjunctures are what Appadurai calls *mediascapes* and *ideoscapes*, which involve closely related landscapes and images. The term *mediascape*⁴⁵ refers to the way in which visual imagery impacts the world and its visual culture. Mediascapes have to do both with the distribution of the electronic means of producing and disseminating information (newspapers, magazines, television stations and film-production studios), which are now available to a growing number of private and public companies, and to the images of the world created by these media⁴⁶. Some other sources of such imagery also include books, and above all, advertising, which can directly impact the landscape in the form of posters and billboards. Mediascapes result from the diffusion of the ability to produce media images and the global spread of those images.

What is most important about these mediascapes is that they provide (especially in their television and film forms) "large and complex repertoires" of images and narratives to the global audiences, which are used in creating local narratives⁴⁷. One example of such influence is the big Wooden Horse that one can see at Troy (Turkish *Truva*)⁴⁸. Some visitors think that "there's not a lot to see at Troy,"⁴⁹ and indeed, Troy is rather bland compared to hundreds of Turkey's other ancient cities, such as Ephesus. To answer these complaints, a 12.5 meters high Wooden Horse recalling the Trojan Horse from ancient *Aeneid*⁵⁰ of Virgil was built in 1974 by the Turkish Ministry of Tourism⁵¹. With no original sources to hand⁵², the horse was basically

The term *Mediascape* was first used in trade by the U.S. company Mediascape Corporation, formed in 1992, for the purpose of delivering rich media through the Internet and Web. Mediascape is the U.S. owner of the Federal trademark for use of that mark in relation to multimedia products in commerce.

These images involve many complicated reflections, depending on their mode (documentary or entertainment), or their hardware (electronic or preelectronic). A. Appadurai, *op. cit.*, p. 35

⁴⁷ A. Appadurai, *op. cit.*, pp. 35-36.

⁴⁸ In modern Turkish, there is a tendency of shifting of the name of the site from *Truva*, which reflects the pronounciation of French name of the place (*Troie*) as that was the language of choice among the Turkish elites up to 1950s, to *Troya*, which is closer to the original Greek name, although both can still be heard interchangeably.

http://www.turkeytravelplanner.com/go/Aegean/Troy/; 21.10.2013.

Latin epic poem from the time of Augustus.

The idea from the then-director of Canakkale Archaeological Museum, Ilhan Aksit.

There are three known surviving classical depictions of the Trojan horse. The earliest is on a fibula brooch dated about 700 BC. The other two are on relief pithos vases from the adjoining Grecian islands Mykonos and Tinos, both usually dated between 675 and 650

a product of architect Izzet Senemoglu's imagination, a war horse with a symbolic ladder suggesting how the Greeks came out. Situated at the entrance to the ancient city, the enormous horse, made of cedar wood, welcomes the hundreds of thousands of tourists who visit Troy every year. Before the horse was built, the tourists complained that they had nothing to photograph there⁵³. Now one can see the Japanese visitors make the "V" sign when posing for photographs (although in Europe the V sign is known as standing for "victory", in Japan it emerged in the 1970s as symbolizing "peace"). The Horse was renovated in 2007 and it is still open to visitors today. However, now it is not the only one. The horse used in the promotional tour of the film Trov directed by Wolfgang Petersen was first erected outside the cinema in Potsdamer Platz for the world premiere in Berlin in May 2004⁵⁴. A deal was then signed between Warner Bros and the Turkish Ministry of Tourism. The horse would be lent for 19 years to be displayed on the waterfront of Canakkale, only 30 kilometers from the site of the ancient Troy⁵⁵. It cost the city of Canakkale 34,000 euro to get the horse transported and erected but it was certainly worth the money. It has proved a huge hit with tourists and became a major attraction in the town.

The Wooden Horse is a potent symbol. The first one, designed by Senemoglu, is often reproduced on postcards and has almost become one of the symbols of the country. This is fitting because it captures the whole story in one image. The case of Troy's horse shows that mediascapes tend to be image-centered, narrative-based accounts of some reality, and what they offer to those who experience and transform them is a series of elements (such as characters, plots, and textual forms) out of which scripts can be formed ⁵⁶.

BC. B.A. Sparks, B.A., *The Trojan Horse in Classical Art*, "Greece & Rome", April 1971, pp. 54-70.

T. Brosnahan, *Turcja*, Lonely Planet, Polish edition, Bielsko-Biała 1999, p. 367.

In fact, the "wooden horse" is made of iron struts and fiberglass. It is 11.4 meters high and weighs 11 tons. From Berlin, the horse first "galloped" to Japan for to satisfy the longings of Brad Pitt's many fans in that country. http://www.grandanzachotel.com/wooden-horse-of-troy.htm. 21.10.2013.

⁵⁵ Ibidem.

⁵⁶ A. Appadurai, *op. cit.*, p. 35.



Postcards, foto & design by Gabrielle Basinski, CAN Kartpostallari

THE BLUE CRUISE: HOW LITERATURE HAS INFLUENCED THE MARINAS

An example of how mediascapes and technoscapes are intertwined and influence each other is the case of the Blue Cruise. *Blue Cruise*, also known as *Blue Voyage* (*Mavi Yolculuk* in Turkish), is a term used for recreational voyages along the Turkish Riviera, on Turkey's southwestern coast⁵⁷. A full Blue Cruise generally starts in Didim or Kuşadası, although the tours may also depart from Bodrum or Marmaris. They usually terminate at the port of Antalya. The term, which is used in Turkey's tourism industry, has its origins in Turkish literature, deriving from the title of a book by Azra Erhat⁵⁸. The term was first introduced into Turkish literature by a handful of writers, such as Cevat Şakir Kabaağaçlı⁵⁹. The author, who had been exiled to Bodrum in 1925, fell in love with the beauty of the local landscape. He began taking trips with his intellectual friends on the sponge divers' sailing boats. These excursions became known as "Blue Cruises". Azra Erhat participated in these excursions. Those who united around the literary revue "Yeni Ufuklar" (*New*

H. Taylor, Where to Raise the Sails or Just a Glass, "The New York Times" July 2, 2006,p. 10.

⁵⁸ A. Erhat, G. Çizgen (2005). *Mavi yolculuk: gezi*, Galatasaray, İstanbul: Can Yayınları.

Cevat Şakir Kabaağaçlı (1890-1973, pen-name exclusively used in his writings, "The Fisherman of Halicarnassus") was a Turkish writer of novels, short-stories and essays, as well as being a keen ethnographer and travelogue. Cevat Şakir had a deep impact on the evolution of intellectual ideas in Turkey during the 20th century. D. Whiting, Dominic (2001). Turkey Handbook, Footprint Handbooks, p. 315. See also: J.P. Thiollet, Bodream, Anagramme Ed., 2010; R. Williams The Fisherman of Halicarnassus: The Man Who Made Bodrum Famous, Bristol Book Publishing 2013.

Horizons) in the 1950s and 1960s have also contributed to the popularity of the Blue Cruise, and guidebooks have been published in Turkish⁶⁰ and German⁶¹. Kabaağaçlı is largely credited for bringing the formerly sleepy fishing town of Bodrum, as well as the entire shoreline of the Blue Cruise, to the attention of the Turkish intelligentsia, which made the region fashionable and later on let it become an international tourist attraction⁶². The case of the Blue Cruise shows that mediascapes and technoscapes influence each other. The imagery deriving from books helped to create the phenomenon of the Cruise and then the modern services offered by the marinas became part of the everyday culture in the area.

The mediascapes, especially in the form of television and film, provide the mass culture images for tourist souvenirs. Visiting the Turkish Riviera, we can buy not only local gifts, such as the traditional blue glass Eye Bead, an amulet used for protection, but also Hello Kitty gifts or children's clothes imitating the costumes of the heroes of popular culture (e.g. Spiderman or Batman) and towels with the characters from Disney's productions. Looking for a souvenir, one can find a small copy of the Artemis from Ephesus whose restored face resembles that of the Barbie doll.



Bitez, 2008, photo E. Wiącek

Bülent Özükan, Mavi yolculuk = Blue voyage (in Turkish). İstanbul: Boyut Yayın Grubu 2005.

M. Hengirmen, Die blaue Reise: mit 201 Fotos des Verfassers und 122 Karten = Mavi yolculuk (in German). Ankara: Eğitim ve Kalkınma Vakfı 2000.

⁶² http:// en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Cevat_%C5%9Eakir_Kabaa%C4%9Fa%C3%A7l%C4%B1# cite_note-2.



Barbie; photo Kinga Zajdel, 2013



Artemis Ephesia or The Lady of Ephesus, 1st century AD, Ephesus Archaeological Museum photo E. Wiącek



Turkish souvenir representing Artemis, 2010; photo E. Wiącek

THE TURKISH FLAG ON A TEACUP

Ideoscapes are also concatenations of images, but they are often directly political and frequently have to do with state ideologies. According to Appadurai, these ideoscapes are composed of the elements of the Enlightenment worldview, which consists of a chain of ideas, terms, and images, including freedom, welfare, rights, sovereignty, representation, and the master term democracy⁶³. But the dissemination of these terms and images across the world, especially since the 19th century, has loosened the internal coherence that held them together in the Euro-American master narrative. As a result, these keywords may be subject to very different sets of contextual conventions that mediate their translation into public politics⁶⁴. In Turkey, these ideas or keywords deeply influenced Kemalism – its founding ideology⁶⁵. Kemalism, also known as Atatürkism (as it was propounded by the first president of the Republic of Turkey, Mustafa Kemal Atatürk), consisted in sweeping political, social, cultural and religious reforms in which all Turkish citizens were declared equal without reference to religion in creating a secular. national, unitary state from the Ottoman Empire (empire of Faith)⁶⁶.

Kemalism derives partly from the tradition of Comtean scientific positivism. It envisions the political future as designed by/for humans, rather than of divine design, so it assumes secular ideas of European modernity for the fulfillment of many political goals in the Muslim context⁶⁷. These goals include individual freedom, citizen equality, rational and accountable education and governing structures. Kemalism sets the boundaries of the social process in the Turkish Reformation. It is a philosophy of modernization, which guided the transition from the multi-religious, multi-ethnic Ottoman Empire to the unitary Republic of Turkey and its secular and nationalistic way of life⁶⁸. The principles of Kemalism were implemented as state ideology only after the death of its founder, Atatürk⁶⁹. There are six of them: Republicanism, Populism,

65 E.J. Zurcher, *Turkey: A Modern History*. New York, J.B. Tauris & Co ltd. 2004, p. 181.

⁶³ A. Appadurai, *op. cit.*, p. 36.

⁶⁴ Ihidem

⁶⁶ U. Azak, Islam and Secularism in Turkey: Kemalism, Religion and the Nation State, I.B. Tauris 2010.

A. Davison, Corporatist Ideology In Kemalist Turkey: Progress Or Order?, Syracuse University Press 2004.

⁶⁸ E.J. Zurcher, *Turkey* (...), *op. cit.*, p. 181.

D. Everett Webster, The Turkey of Atatürk; Social Process in the Turkish Reformation, New York: AMS Press 1973, p. 245.

Nationalism⁷⁰, Secularism, Statism⁷¹, Revolutionism⁷². The principles came to be recognized as unchangeable and sacrosanct. Republicanism⁷³ replaced the absolute monarchy of the Ottoman Dynasty with the rule of the law, popular sovereignty and civic virtue, including an emphasis on liberty practiced by the citizens⁷⁴. Populism is defined as a social revolution aimed to transfer the political power to the citizens. Kemalist populism differs from the Western understanding of the concept. In Western European culture, populism is a political doctrine where one sides with "the people" against "the elites". In the Ottoman Empire, "the people" were subjected to

Kemalist nationalism originates from the social contract theories, especially from the principles advocated by Jean-Jacques Rousseau and his Social Contract. The Kemalist perception of social contract was effected by the dissolution of the Ottoman Empire which was perceived as a product of failure of the Ottoman system. Kemalist nationalism, after experiencing the Ottoman Empire's breakdown into pieces, defined the social contract as its "highest ideal". http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Kemalism

Kemal Atatürk made clear in his statements and policies that Turkey's complete modernization was very much dependent on economic and technological development. The principle of Kemalist Statism is generally interpreted to mean that the state was to regulate the country's general economic activities and the state was to engage in areas where private enterprise was not willing to do so, or where private enterprise had proven to be inadequate, or if national interest required it. In the application of the principle of statism, however, the state emerged not only as the principal source of economic activity, but also as the owner of the major industries of the country. B. Sansal, *All About Turkey*, http://www.allaboutturkey.com/ata_prensip. htm, 22.10.2013

Revolutionism: a principle formulated by Atatürk, which means that the country should replace the traditional institutions and concepts with modern institutions and concepts. This principle advocated the need for fundamental social change through revolution as a strategy to achieve a modern society. Revolutionism is a principle of kemalism, which means that the country should replace the traditional institutions and concepts with modern institutions and concepts. This principle advocated the need for fundamental social change to achieve a modern society. The current understanding of this concept can be described that active modification. P. Hamilton, *Emile Durkheim: Critical Assessments*, Routledge 1995, p. 69.

Among the many types of republic, the Kemalist republic is a representative democracy with a Parliament chosen in general elections, a President as head of state elected by Parliament and serving for a limited term, a Prime Minister appointed by the President, and other Ministers appointed by Parliament.

Kemalist republicanism defines a type of constitutional republic, in which representatives of the people are elected, and must govern in accordance with existing constitutional law limiting governmental power over citizens. The head of state and other officials are chosen by election rather than inheriting their positions, and their decisions are subject to judicial review. In defending the change from the Ottoman State, Kemalism asserts that all laws of the Republic of Turkey should be inspired by actual needs here on Earth as a basic tenet of national life. Mustafa Kemal as quoted in *A World View of Criminal Justice* by R.K. Vogler, Aldershot Asgate, 2005, p. 116.

autocracy⁷⁵, theocracy (Caliphate) and feudalism (tribal leaders). Kemalism moved the orientation of political power towards the best interest of the "general public". Kemalist populism denies the types of national unity based on racial, religious, totalitarian and fascist ideologies, by claiming that "Unconditional, unrestricted sovereignty belongs to the people", Kemalist criteria for national identity or simply being a Turk are a shared language, and/or shared values defined as common history, and the will to share a future. Kemalist ideology defines the "Turkish people" as: "Those who protect and promote the moral, spiritual, cultural and humanistic values of the Turkish Nation"⁷⁸. Considering these criteria, it is no wonder that most of the people living in Turkey define themselves as "Turkish people" and identify with the nation. The ideoscape of the country reflects this attitude and conviction. Even in the Turkish Riviera, where the impact of new global cultural economy is especially strong, one can see much evidence of nationcentred attitudes. They are expressed by the Turkish flags. The number of national flags can be surprising for the tourists from abroad. They can be seen everywhere and every day, not only on national holidays. The Turkish people joke that when one looks around and does not see any Turkish flag, it means that one is probably no longer in Turkey⁷⁹. The nation-centred orientation is also expressed by the images of Turkish flags placed every-where possible: on cars, motorbikes and even on teacups and glasses. Another expression of Kemalism are the numerous portraits of its founder Mustafa Kemal Atatürk. There is almost no place without his portraits. They are present not only in institutions, offices and museums, but also in hotels, restaurants, tea houses, and on all Turkish banknotes. You can also find them on many souvenirs.

⁷⁵ Ottoman Dynasty.

General public = citizens of the country, common citizens, citizenship. Kemalist populism is an extension of the Kemalist modernization movement. The Kemalist reforms brought about a revolutionary change in the status of women.

Mustafa Kemal Atatürk as quoted in: *Constitution and Foundations of the State System* Embassy of the Republic of Turkey, Washington, DC. http://heinonline.org/HOL/Landing Page?collection=&handle=hein.journals/mistjintl3&div=35&id=&page=; 22.10.2013.

Republic Of Turkey Ministry Of National Education. "Turkish National Education System". T.C. Government, http://www.unesco.org/education/wef/countryreports/turkey/contents. html: 23.10.2013.

A. Bromberek, A. Wielgołaska, op. cit., p. 22.





Bodrum, 2009; photo E. Wiącek



Izmir 2011; photo E. Wiącek



Ephesus, 2009; photo E. Wiącek

Kemalist ideology perceived the French model as the prototypical form of secularism. Kemalism strove to control religion and reduce it to a private belief⁸⁰. Kemalist laicism does not imply or advocate agnosticism or nihilism; it means freedom of thought and independence of the institutions of the state from the dominance of religious thought and religious institutions⁸¹. The ideoscape of the Riviera reflects this model of laicism. Bars are situated next to mosques, souvenirs with the images of the Virgin Mary⁸² are sold together with the portraits of Atatürk.



Turgutreis, 2009; photo E. Wiącek

ORIENTALISM REVISED

Another important idea which has a big impact on the ideoscape of the Turkish Riviera is Orientalism. In the discourse of tourism, modernity is identified with the Occident, while ahistorical, sensual paradise with "the Orient" (in Turkey embodied in belly dancers). Another feature attributed to the oriental aspect of Turkey is its warm hospitality⁸³. The websites for the Western tourists create the image of the Turkish people as "Oriental":

⁸⁰ S. Hanioglu, *Atatürk: An Intellectual Biography*, Princeton University Press 2011, p. 153.

http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Kemalism; 11.11.2013.

Her house is believed to situated near Ephesus.

http://www.tui.pl/wakacje-samolotem/blisko-i-cieplo/turcja/riwiera-turecka, see also: http://www.gti-travel.pl/pl/informacje/turcja-informacje-wycieczki-fakultatywne-egejska; 2.10.2013.

Turkish people are mid Asia oriented. They have lived in tents and were nomads. In the history they have spread to all over the world from central Asia, where most settled in Caucasia and Anatolia from the 10th century A.D.on. This moving characteristic created some peculiarities that are exclusively Turkish. The two characteristic traits of the Turkish people are hospitality and close family relations... Hospitality is one of the cornerstones of the Turkish way of life. Turkish people are the most gracious and generous hosts as a result of their natural instincts. In every corner of the country such a traditional hospitality will meet you. They will open their houses to every guest with a smiling face and with all their sincerity give the best seat and cook the best food for their guest. (...) The mentality of that hospitality is "whatever religion you are from, whichever country you come from, whatever language you speak, you are 'God's Guest'", so you deserve to be welcomed in the best manner.

This description emphasizes some features typical of "the Oriental", such as behavior derived from natural instincts. On the other hand, this description reveals that the Turkish people are not culturally backward. They are aware of the Western way of life and "they are very understanding about foreigners' different customs and they try to communicate in order to help visitors according to their code of hospitality",85. The description of the family relations contributes to this wonderful image. According to it, Turks respect their elders and support each other in every way. 86

Talking about the complex ideas of the Orient, Said distinguishes Oriental sensuality. He points out that in the works of many Oriental artists, Middle Eastern women are often depicted as sensual creatures, whose only use was to be sexual slaves⁸⁷. French artists such as Eugène Delacroix or Jean-Léon Gérôme painted many works depicting the Islamic culture, often including lounging odalisques. When Jean Auguste Dominique Ingres, director of the French Académie de peinture, painted his vision of a Turkish bath, he made his eroticized Orient publicly acceptable. This imagery persisted in art into the early 20th century, as evidenced in Matisse's oriental semi-nudes.

The Turks themselves seem to be aware of the stereotype of an oversexed Oriental focused only on the pleasures of the body. They confirm the cliché

http://www.enjoyturkey.com/info/culture/People_Folklore.htm; 2.10.2013.

⁸⁵ Ibidem.

³⁶ Ihidem.

⁸⁷ Said furthers his theory with identifying the West defined itself as being of the "contrasting image" of the East, one illuminating a sensual culture which seethed sexuality polar to Euro-Christian culture which viewed women as being asexual.

image whose roots stem from 19th century images of Turkish baths – *hammam*. In postcards and leaflets, contemporary photos are juxtaposed with the pictures by Orientalist painters. Sometimes their design and the style of the photos are based on the 19th century canvases.

On the other hand, one of the main websites advertising Turkey as a tourist destination features some descriptions of *hammam* devoid of sexual context. Instead, a *hammam* is shown as a very important place in Turkish daily and historical life, as a result of the emphasis placed upon cleanliness by Islam:

When the Turks arrived in Anatolia, they brought with them one bathing tradition, and were confronted with another, that of Romans and Byzantines, with certain local variants. The traditions merged, and with the addition of the Moslem concern for cleanliness and its concomitant respect for the uses of water, there arose an entirely new concept, that of the Turkish Bath. In time it became an institution, with its system of ineradicable customs. For the Turkish bath was much more than just a place to cleanse the skin. It was intimately bound up with everyday life, a place where people of every rank and station, young and old, rich and poor, townsman or villager, could come freely⁸⁸.

Important occasions in a Turk's life were, and in some townships still are, celebrated with rejoicing at the bath. These included the newborn's fortieth day, the Circumcision, the bathing of the brides, etc. The phenomenon of the Turkish bath, then, resides in its bringing together many dimensions of the society's culture to create an institution with a deep-seated social character. The description above which emphasizes that *hammam* was not only the place of erotic *rendez-vous* (as the European imagined it) shows that "the Orientals" begin to speak for themselves and to question their image created by the Westerners.

Not only postcards, but also some facts from the public space show that the Turkish people are aware of the concept of Orientalism, and they use it in a very conscious manner. Sometimes they even seem to mock the concept of "Oriental sensuality". The bazaars in tourist sites offer the Westerners "sex tea" which is actually nothing more than a mixture of fruit teas. Traditional sweets are advertised as "Turkish viagra". This strategy is almost a caricature of "the Oriental sensuality".

http://www.enjoyturkey.com/Tours; 3.10.2013.



Turgutreis, 2009, photo E. Wiącek



Postcard, Turkish Bath, Bodrum, Art Kartpostal ve yayncilik

The design of the interiors and public spaces in tourist resorts also refers to the idea of the Oriental splendor and Oriental sensuality. It evokes the atmosphere of comfort, passivity and harem-like relaxation. This adoption of the image originally shaped by the Westerners resembles a play with mirrors. "The Oriental" is holding the mirror and reflects the image of "the Orient", showing it to the Western tourists. Sometimes these oriental settings have an admixture of the Occident – the piles of pillows bear the logos of Western companies producing drinks, e.g. the American Miller Brewing Company. In this case, ideoscape is intertwined with finanscape.



Bitez 2008; photo E. Wiącek



Bitez 2008; photo E. Wiącek

The strategy based on combining Oriental and Occidental elements is especially visible in the region of the Aegian Sea. One can note two strategies of shaping the image or ideoscape of the area. Some advertisements recall the ancient Greek or Roman past – in this case this part of the country is shown as the cradle of the Occidental culture. This generates a kind of

paradox, since according to most Europeans, civilization appeared in Turkey only after the reforms of Mustafa Kemal Atatürk. Another strategy of promoting the country is to emphasize the "Oriental" character of the place. In this case the elements of the image refer back to the times of the Ottoman Empire, viz. the oriental style of design at hotels or restaurants, the *hammam*, the belly dancers. It is possible to interpret this as an echo of the *Turquerie*, the Orientalist fashion in Western Europe between the 16th and the 18th centuries for imitating aspects of Turkish art and culture. Music, paintings, architecture, and artifacts were frequently inspired by the Turkish and Ottoman styles and designs. Following these exotic fashions, one would show one's elite place in society as well as display one's open-mindedness and interest in the world⁸⁹.



http://users.rowan.edu/~polikar/TURKIYE/ege.html90

John Urry has created the concept of the *tourist gaze*⁹¹, taking "gaze" as a metaphor for tourist practices, relations of power, and the mechanisms that put these into effect. Urry construes the tourist gaze as a practice of the consumption of what is regarded as extraordinary by tourists regardless of what those "spectacles" may mean for the "local" populations.

Places are chosen to be gazed upon because there is an anticipation, especially through daydreaming and fantasy, of intense pleasures, either on a different scale or involving different senses from those customarily

⁸⁹ I. Breskin, On the Periphery of a Greater World: John Singleton Copley's "Turquerie" Portraits. Winterthur Portfolio, Vol. 36, No. 2/3. Summer – Autumn, 2001, p. 97.

⁹⁰ The photo from the article *Turkey – The Cradle of Civilizations. The Aegean Region.*

⁹¹ J. Urry, *The tourist gaze*, Sage Publication Ltd London, 1990, p. 3.

encountered. Such anticipation is constructed and sustained through a variety of non-tourist practices, such as film, TV, literature, magazines, records and videos, which construct and reinforce that gaze ⁹².

The statement above shows that mediascapes have big impact on tourists' expectations and practices. Moreover, assuming that Orientalism has influenced so many areas of culture (literature, art, music, architecture, photography, films, pulp magazines), the tourist gaze also contains the Orientalists' gaze.

Having in mind the concept of the tourist gaze, the reason for creating this ambiguous image is not only geopolitical. Another reason is the tourists who visit Turkey. They expect modern facilities and high technological standards, but at the same time they are looking for something exotic. The *scapes* constituting the Turkish Riviera respond to these complex expectations and to the tourist gaze based on collecting signs. The tourists want to tick boxes and take back home characteristic oriental images, but they also expect to have easy access to their English breakfast every morning. Moreover, according to Urry, there is no single tourist gaze as such. It varies by society, social group and by historical period. Such gazes are constructed by difference⁹³. For this reason, the answers to the question "What does Turkey offer to visitors?" include diving, golf, delicious cuisine, Biblical values, rafting, jeep safari, and nightlife⁹⁴.

Said stresses that the discursive construction of the Oriental serves a vital purpose: it subtends the exclusionary process upon which European identity is predicated, that is, the "idea of European identity as a superior one in comparison with all the non-European peoples and cultures". The result is an "idea of Europe, a collective notion identifying 'us' Europeans as against all those non-Europeans". Meanwhile, the disjunctive *scapes* of the Turkish Riviera seems to blur the clear-cut division between Europeans and non-Europeans. Turkey itself wants to play the role of a bridge between Europe and Asia, between the West and the East. The elements which constitute the constellation of ideas called Occident and Orient are blended. The Orient seems even to contain the Occident, to include the elements important for the Western culture, like the Biblical tradition or the ancient Greek culture. In

⁹² *Ibidem*, p. 3.

⁹³ *Ibidem*, p. 2.

http://www.enjoyturkey.com/index.htm.

⁹⁵ E. Said, *op. cit.*, p. 7.

⁹⁶ *Ibidem*, p. 7.

such a case, Occident and Orient resemble broken mirrors whose fragments are arranged into a mosaic, showing that these two realities do not have to be opposed.

"ORIENT" W GLOBALNYCH PRZEPŁYWACH KULTUROWYCH: PRZYPADEK RIWIERY TURECKIEJ (streszczenie)

Na przestrzeni ostatnich dwóch dekad turystyka stała się najmocniejszą stroną tureckiej gospodarki, zaś najchętniej odwiedzane miejsca w Turcji są sceną intensywnych interakcji społeczno-kulturowych o charakterze globalnym. Analizując złożoną specyfikę przestrzeni publicznej w kurortach na obszarze Riwiery Tureckiej, zastosuję zaproponowany przez Arjuna Appaduraia model bazujący na rozłącznym przepływie kategorii określonych przez autora mianem pejzaży. Głównym celem analizy jest zbadanie czy "Orient" w ujęciu Edwarda Saida nadal istnieje w dyskursie turystycznym i związanym z nim obrazowaniu.

Słowa klucze: Riwiera Turecka, Orient, pejzaż, rozłączny przepływ.